



**Jointly Held
Finance/Personnel and Planning Committees
Meeting Minutes**

February 20, 2024

Members Present: Sharon Hairston, Chair
Al Fullenkamp
John A. Lumpkin, Jr.
Belinda Matthews-Stenson
Grady Mullins
Thomas Weckesser
David P. Williamson

Excused: Nikol Miller
Sharon D. White

Staff in Attendance: Bob Ruzinsky
Daron Brown
Sally Brown
Roland Caldwell
Julie Hoffman
Ben Mazer, Coolidge Wall
Jessica Olsen
Shawn Prince
Mary K. Stanforth
Tamea Weisman

Citizen in Attendance: John Gower

Ms. Hairston called the meeting to order at 8:35 a.m. and roll call was taken:

Roll Call

Ms. Hairston -	Yes
Mr. Fullenkamp -	Yes
Mr. Lumpkin	Yes
Ms. Matthews-Stenson -	Yes
Ms. Miller -	Excused
Mr. Mullins -	Yes
Mr. Weckesser -	Yes
Ms. White -	Excused
Mr. Williamson -	Yes

A quorum was present, and proper notice of the meeting had been given.

Approval of January 16, 2024 Jointly Held Finance/Personnel and Planning Committees Meeting Minutes

Ms. Hairston asked if attendees request a reading of the minutes or have corrections to the minutes?

Upon hearing no requests or corrections, Ms. Hairston DECLARED the January 16, 2024 minutes are APPROVED.

Board Action Items

Action Item #2 - Underground Storage Tank Replacement Project

Mr. Brown stated the purpose of this procurement is to select a firm to partner with Greater Dayton Regional Transit Authority (RTA) for the replacement of underground storage tanks.

This project involves the following items:

- The removal of two (2) 20,000-gallon diesel tanks and one (1) 2,000-gallon motor oil tank.
- The purchase and installation of one (1) new 20,000-gallon diesel tank with two (2) high-volume submersible pumps installed for redundancy and one (1) 2,000-gallon motor oil tank.
- An upgrade to the Veeder Root 450-Plus tank monitoring system applies to 600 Longworth and 601 Longworth locations.

This procurement supports our core values of Safety and good Stewardship of RTA’s financial and environmental resources by ensuring that our facilities are well maintained and environmentally responsible.

Sealed bids for the Underground Storage Tank Replacement Project were solicited through *Dayton Daily News*, *Dayton Weekly News*, and *Transit Talent*. Invitations for Bid were sent to 106 firms.

At 10:00 a.m., on January 25, 2024, two (2) bids were received and publicly opened. The results were as follows:

Firm	Reliable Construction Services Dayton, OH	Belgray, Inc. Wilmington, OH
General	\$49,311	\$240,000
Existing Conditions	11,517	80,000
Concrete	74,289	85,000
Plumbing	309,828	500,000
Electrical	47,774	80,000
Earthwork	852,331	689,000
Utilities	39,090	40,320
Base Bid Total	\$ 1,384,140	\$ 1,714,320

MOTION made by Ms. Matthews-Stenson and SECONDED by Mr. Lumpkin that the Finance/Personnel and Planning Committees RECOMMEND to the Board of Trustees an AWARD to

Reliable Construction Services for the replacement of the underground storage tanks in the amount of \$1,384,140 plus a 15% contingency of \$207,621 for any unforeseen costs, totaling \$1,591,761.

The MOTION was APPROVED by voice vote 7-0.

Action Item #3 - Window Washing Services

Mr. Brown stated the purpose of this procurement is to select a qualified firm to partner with RTA for Window Washing Services at Wright Stop Plaza, 600 and 601 Longworth, and Transit Center locations.

The contract is for five (5) years, during which time the selected firm will be responsible for cleaning the inside and outside of the windows at all the locations listed above. This project is consistent with RTA’s core value of providing good Stewardship by properly maintaining our facilities and ensuring the longevity of our capital resources.

Proposals for the Window Washing Services were solicited through the *Dayton Daily News*, *Dayton Weekly News*, and *Transit Talent*. Requests for Proposals were sent to eleven (11) firms.

At 2:00 p.m., December 21, 2023, three (3) proposals were received. The Evaluation Committee reviewed the proposals to determine the best proposal using the following criteria:

- Qualifications
- Experience
- Reasonableness of cost
- References
- Quality of Proposal Preparation

The firm ranked the highest by the evaluation committee was Jack & Joe’s Window Cleaning, Inc. dba Squeegee Squad. The pricing received is as follows:

Contract Years	Jack & Joe’s Window Cleaning, Inc. dba Squeegee Squad Columbus, MN	Bright View Exterior Solutions Farmersville, OH	**Central Window Cleaning Cleveland, OH
Year One	\$27,620.00	*	*
Year Two	28,448.60	*	*
Year Three	29,302.14	*	*
Year Four	30,181.24	*	*
Year Five	31,086.72	*	*
Grand Total	\$146,638.70	*	*

*FTA Procurement guidelines require that only the successful proposer’s pricing data be disclosed publicly.

**Nonresponsive.

This procurement will be funded through RTA’s operating budget.

MOTION made by Ms. Matthews-Stenson and SECONDED Mr. Lumpkin that the Finance/Personnel and Planning Committees RECOMMEND to the Board of Trustees a contract AWARD to Jack & Joe’s Window Cleaning, Inc. dba Squeegee Squad for Window Washing Services at Wright Stop Plaza,

600 and 601 Longworth, and the Transit Centers for five (5) years totaling \$146,639 plus a 15% contingency for \$21,996 to address any additional cleanings that may arise during the contract for a total award of \$168,635.

The MOTION was APPROVED by voice vote 7-0.

Action Item #4 - Non-Revenue Vehicles

Mr. Ruzinsky stated the RTA has a pool vehicle fleet that needs replacing due to age. This project has been delayed because we prioritized fleet replacements first.

Vehicles being replaced include:

- 5 – 2012 model year Dodge Durango
- 2 – 2014 model year Dodge Durango
- 2 – 2015 model year Dodge Durango
- 1 – 2015 model year Ford Focus
- 1 – 2016 model year Dodge Durango
- 1 – 2016 model year Ford Transit
- 1 – 2017 model year Dodge Durango
- 1 – 2020 model year Dodge Pickup (will be retained for other use)

These pool vehicles are used for travel between buildings and hubs, contractor oversight, staff supervision, project management, local meetings, community events, and other transit-related purposes. In addition to the 14 replacements, we will be adding a pool vehicle to the fleet for a total of 15. This project supports RTA's core value of Stewardship as we manage our resources.

RTA can purchase non-revenue vehicles from ODOT contracts and will be doing so for this vehicle procurement. State term contracts and bid term contracts are contracts created through a competitive process using Federal Transit Administration regulations and evaluated by the State of Ohio.

RTA obtained grant funding to replace these vehicles over the past few years. After evaluating the various vehicles available with ODOT-authorized vendors, it has been determined that the Ford Explorer is the best vehicle based on reliability, price, and delivery dates. The price received is \$38,740 per vehicle.

This contract will be funded with federal funds.

MOTION made by Ms. Matthews-Stenson and SECONDED by Mr. Fullenkamp that the Finance/Personnel and Planning Committees RECOMMEND to the Board of Trustees a contract AWARD to Montrose Ford for 15 Ford Explorer vehicles at \$38,740 per vehicle for \$581,100 plus a 10% contingency for additional vehicle options in the amount of \$58,110 for a total award of \$639,210.

The MOTION was APPROVED by voice vote 7-0.

Action Item #5 - Internet Access, Part 2

Mr. Prince stated the purpose of this procurement is to award a sole source contract to Altafiber, formerly Cincinnati Bell, for the network connection between RTA 600 Longworth Street facility and Wright Stop Plaza for a three (3) year period.

To support the organization's growing data needs, a more robust and reliable network connection is needed between Wright Stop Plaza and 600 Longworth Street. The current connection is provided by

a microwave antennae system prone to down/degraded performance based on weather and atmospheric changes. This project is consistent with RTA's core value of providing good Stewardship by properly managing our resources efficiently.

Altafiber was chosen as RTA's new internet provider from a prior competitive procurement selection. When running the new fiber to our facilities, the vendor (as standard practice) included additional pairs of fiber for future use. Using this existing infrastructure allows for turning on the service with no additional groundwork (trenching, penetrating the buildings, etc.) to be done. The need for the new fiber/connection was discovered after the original project was underway.

RTA is also attempting to put this new connection in place before the roof work project at 600 Longworth Street, which will temporarily take the existing microwave solution offline, leaving the sites disconnected while work takes place. This solution would remove that risk.

Pricing was received from Altafiber for \$1,105 per month per port (10GB) for Wright Stop Plaza and 600 Longworth Street, totaling \$2,210 per month for a total of \$79,560 for a three (3) year period. Based on a cost comparison to the current contract for Internet Service only for \$929 per month (1GB) and \$859 per month (500MB), the cost for this procurement is deemed fair and reasonable.

MOTION made by Mr. Weckesser and SECONDED by Mr. Williamson that the Finance/Personnel and Planning Committees RECOMMEND to the Board of Trustees a contract AWARD to Altafiber for Internet Access, Part 2, at \$2,210 per month for a 3-year period for \$79,560. It is also recommended that the \$97,680 awarded under Small Purchasing Procedures be ratified for a grand total award amount of \$177,240.

The MOTION was APPROVED by voice vote 7-0.

Action Item #6 - Apteon Upgrade and Software Maintenance

Mr. Prince stated RTA has utilized the Ross Enterprise accounting system software for nearly 35 years. Procurement, Inventory, and Accounting use the software daily. It includes general ledger, accounts payable, accounts receivable, fixed assets, purchasing, and receiving. Major upgrades were performed on the system in 2007 and 2018-2020.

Given the rising support costs of the current Apteon financial system, RTA plans to evaluate the feasibility of selecting an Enterprise Resource Planning (ERP) system to evaluate replacement options for the current HRIS and financial systems in use by RTA. This replacement plan will take approximately two years to accomplish.

Meanwhile, an upgrade to the Apteon system is needed to bring the system and underlying infrastructure current, as the existing version is on an unsupported version of Windows and SQL. The software maintenance is also due to expire at the end of March and must be renewed. This project supports RTA's core value of Stewardship of the financial resources entrusted to our care.

The cost for Aptean to perform this work is as follows:

UPGRADE

Phase	Amount
Initiation	\$ 18,340
Analysis	9,432
Configuration	89,604
Deployment	37,990
Support and PM	30,916
TOTAL	\$186,282

MAINTENANCE

Aptean quoted a price of \$120,497.97 for one year of maintenance, as they refuse to do multi-year maintenance agreements.

As this is a sole-source procurement, a cost analysis was performed to determine if the pricing received is fair and reasonable. Aptean's pricing for the upgrade was found to be high, and negotiations are ongoing until we can agree on a fair and reasonable price. The pricing for the maintenance increased by almost 17% from last year but was found to cover more products, which deems it fair and reasonable.

The cost of the upgrade will be paid with operating funds. The cost for maintenance will be funded with segregated funds.

MOTION made by Mr. Weckesser and SECONDED by Ms. Matthews-Stenson that the Finance/Personnel and Planning Committees RECOMMEND to the Board of Trustees a contract AWARD to Aptean, Inc. for the upgrade of the software in the estimated amount of \$186,282 plus a 20% contingency in the amount of \$37,256 and the maintenance for one (1) year in the amount of \$120,498 for a not to exceed total of \$344,036.

The MOTION was APPROVED by voice vote 7-0.

Customer and Business Development Update

The Customer and Business Development Department update was provided in today's meeting packet.

Mr. Ruzinsky made a presentation on RTA revenues and provided comparative data and analysis regarding the possibility of future fare structure changes.

December 2023 Financial Report

Ms. Stanforth stated the December 2023 Financial Report was provided in today's meeting packet. Passenger fares are \$1.9 million over budget because of post-pandemic increased ridership. Total revenue is \$4 million under budget due to higher passenger fares, interest and sales tax, offset by lower federal and state assistance. Total expenses are \$4.6 million under budget due to lower paid employee absences, fringe benefits, contract services, materials & supplies and contingency costs. Those positive variances are offset by higher employee wages and purchased transportation costs. RTA's service loss

is \$2.2 million after twelve months, which compares to a budgeted service loss of \$2.8 million. The overall financial result tracks favorably compared to budget.

Small Purchasing Information

Ms. Weisman stated the Small Purchasing Information was included in today’s meeting packet. There were no questions regarding small purchases.

CEO Update

Mr. Ruzinsky made a presentation on Wright Stop Plaza and plans to complete construction in the concourse.

Request for Executive Session

MOTION made by Ms. Matthews-Stenson and SECONDED by Mr. Fullenkamp to RECESS into Executive Session for the purpose of discussing personnel matters.

Roll Call

Ms. Hairston -	Yes
Mr. Fullenkamp -	Yes
Mr. Lumpkin	Yes
Ms. Matthews-Stenson -	Yes
Ms. Miller -	Excused
Mr. Mullins -	Yes
Mr. Weckesser -	Yes
Ms. White -	Excused
Mr. Williamson -	Yes

The MOTION was APPROVED 7-0. The Meeting RECESSED into Executive Session at 9:55 a.m.

Reconvene to Regular Session

MOTION made by Mr. Williamson and SECONDED by Mr. Weckesser to RECONVENE into Regular Session.

Roll Call

Ms. Hairston -	Yes
Mr. Fullenkamp -	Yes
Mr. Lumpkin	Yes
Ms. Matthews-Stenson -	Yes
Ms. Miller -	Excused
Mr. Mullins -	Yes
Mr. Weckesser -	Yes
Ms. White -	Excused
Mr. Williamson -	Yes

The MOTION was APPROVED 7-0.

The regular meeting RECONVENED at 10:26 a.m.

Next Meeting

The upcoming jointly held Finance/Personnel and Planning Committees meetings are scheduled for March 19 and April 16, 2024.

Adjournment

With no further business, Ms. Hairston DECLARED the meeting ADJOURNED at 10:27 a.m.

ATTEST



Sharon Hairston, Chair


Mary K. Stanforth, Committee Secretary